

#### www.bea.aero

<sup>(1)</sup>Except where otherwise indicated, times in this report are local.

### Refuelling error, power drop during initial climb, ditching in the sea

Aircraft	PA46 350P Malibu Mirage registered D-ESPE, Lycoming TIO-540-AE2A engine
Date and time	31 August 2015 at 08 h 55 <sup>(1)</sup>
Operator	Private
Place	Mandelieu (06)
Type of flight	General aviation
Persons on board	Pilot and passenger
Consequences and damage	Pilot and passenger slightly injured, aeroplane destroyed

This is a courtesy translation by the BEA of the Final Report on the Safety Investigation. As accurate as the translation may be, the original text in French is the work of reference.

### **1 - HISTORY OF FLIGHT**

The pilot, accompanied by two passengers, had undertaken a flight between the aerodromes of Triengen (Switzerland) and Cannes Mandelieu (06) on the previous Friday.

On arrival, at about 20 h 00, when he had just got out of the aeroplane, a ramp agent asked him if he wanted to refuel. The pilot accepted. The operator in charge of refuelling received a request for Jet A1 fuel and went to the stand where the aeroplane was. On arrival, he asked the pilot<sup>(2)</sup>, in French, how much fuel he wanted. After confirmation of the price by the operator, the pilot said that he wanted to fill up, and then returned to moor the aeroplane. The operator refuelled the right wing tank with Jet A1, then the left wing. Following the refuelling, he filled in the delivery note mentioning the quantity<sup>(3)</sup> and the type of fuel supplied then had the document signed by the pilot, who kept a copy.

On the Monday, the pilot, accompanied by a passenger, arrived at about 08 h 15 at the aerodrome, to perform a flight between Cannes Mandelieu and Triengen. He performed the pre-flight check then started the engine without encountering any problems and asked for clearance to taxi at 08 h 50. He performed the engine tests at the stop point, lined up on runway 17 and took off.

During initial climb, the engine made some unusual noises. The pilot checked the engine parameters. These were normal. The power decreased and aeroplane's speed dropped suddenly. The pilot maintained a straight flight path and sufficient speed for the flight and ditched in the sea. The pilot and the passenger were slightly injured on impact.



<sup>(3)</sup>403 litres were added. RFPORI

ACCIDENT

### **2 - ADDITIONAL INFORMATION**

# 2.1 Aircraft information

The Piper PA 46 350P is equipped with a Lycoming TIO-540-AE2A piston engine that runs on AVGAS 100LL petrol. Placards are placed on the wings near each tank filler cap to indicate the type of fuel to use. The tank filling ports do not allow nozzles used for refuelling with Jet A1 to be inserted, as they are fitted with fool proof devices, in order to prevent refuelling errors.



Figure 1 : placard on the wing

The aeroplane is equipped with wing tanks with a capacity of 60 US gallons<sup>(4)</sup> each. The fuel flows from these tanks to 1 US gallon collector tanks located in each wing wheel well area. Non-return valves prevent the fuel present in the collector tanks from flowing back into the tanks<sup>(5)</sup>. The fuel then flows into the engine through pipes and filters. A sump drain is located in each collector tank. There is no other drain at the level of the tanks.



Figure 2 : fuel system

The fuel delivered to the pilot the previous Friday was Jet A1. This fuel being denser than 100LL petrol, it settled into the lower parts of the wing tanks.

BEA Safety Investigations are conducted with the sole objective of improving aviation safety and are not intended to apportion blame or liability.

#### <sup>(4)</sup>Equal to 227 litres.

<sup>(5)</sup>The manufacturer stated that it is not impossible for the fuel present in the collector tanks to mix with the fuel in the other tanks.

# 2.2 Pre-flight procedure

This procedure describes the actions for the pilot to take before the flight, specifically relating to checking the fuel. For each wing, the pilot must check the fuel at the level of tank cap, drain and check for water, sediment and proper fuel.

### 2.3 Refuelling procedures

### 2.3.1 Aerodrome operator's refuelling procedure

This procedure states that the Cannes Mandelieu aerodrome operator uses a fuel depot for the refuelling needs of aircraft using the aerodrome.

It states that a procurement system for the supply and onboard delivery of fuel was attributed to the Air BP fuel supplier and that onboard delivery was sub-contracted by the supplier to the Norbert Dentressangle Hydrocarbures company. The procedures applicable by the sub-contractor were those of the fuel supplier: one procedure described the ordering of fuel, another the refuelling. They are repeated to all operators responsible for refuelling during their recurrent training, which takes place annually.

The aerodrome operator undertakes the administrative management of fuel activity and specifically records the requests and the fuel delivery notes.

### 2.3.2 Fuel supplier's procedure for fuel ordering

This procedure states that confirmation of the grade of fuel must be done at each of the six stages described below:

- □ 1. When the fuel order is made to the sub-contractor, the details relating to the grade and quantity of fuel, the aircraft registration and the time of the operation must be requested from the client. When a verbal order is made face to face, a reformulation of the request using the terms « *Jet A1* » or « *AVGAS* » is required.
- 2. The details of the order are copied by the sub-contractor onto a fuel order form, except in case of a verbal order from the client to the operator in charge of refuelling next to the aeroplane in the case of immediate refuelling.
- 3. The person taking the fuel order passes it on to the operator in charge of refuelling, possibly via another operator.
- 4. When the operator in charge of refuelling receives the fuel order, he/she must reformulate exactly all of the details of the order to the person who gives it to him/her and must record it on an order form which should be in the vehicle cabin. The order form is specific for each of the two types of fuel, with a distinctive colour for each product.

- 5. Before beginning refuelling the aircaft, the operator in charge of refuelling makes a cross-check of three points:
  - check of the order form;
  - check that the fuel required corresponds to the fuel that the vehicle is carrying;
  - check the placards on the aircraft at the level of the tank caps, which must correspond to the order, before any operation involving installing the refuelling equipment. If there is no placard on the aircraft, refuelling must not take place before applying the « no decal, no fuel » procedure.
- □ 6. At the end of aeroplane refuelling, a delivery note must be written by the operator in charge of refuelling, preferably in the presence of the client, so that the latter signs the section of the document corresponding to the confirmation of the grade of fuel.

At Cannes Mandelieu aerodrome, the aerodrome operator is the first contact for the client in relation to requests for fuel. He then retransmits the request to the sub-contractor, specifying the type of fuel required, the registration and the position of the aeroplane at the stand. The procedure for taking an order used by the sub-contractor described above is not applicable by the aerodrome operator. This must be done by the operator in charge of refuelling on his/her arrival at the aeroplane; specifically, the procedure states that the operator must reformulate the request to the pilot by using the terms « *Jet A1* » or « *AVGAS* », once arrived at the aeroplane with the truck corresponding to the type of fuel already chosen following the exchanges with the aerodrome operator.

### 2.3.3 Refuelling procedure via nozzle with a refuelling vehicle

This procedure states that before refuelling, a confirmation is made at the aeroplane with the aid of the placards indicating the type of fuel and that this stage must always be performed before installing any refuelling operation equipment.

If the type indicated on the placard is different from the type of fuel contained in the vehicle, the operator must request confirmation by the client by filling out a grade order confirmation form, which should be signed by, and write a report on this near-incident.

If the aeroplane does not have a placard clearly indicating the type of fuel used, the operator must apply the « *no decal, no fuel* » procedure by filling out a grade order confirmation form, stating the correct type required, which the pilot must sign, and recording the event in the near-incident log and offering the pilot some placards correctly indicating the type of fuel on the aeroplane. In case of a refusal, the refuelling operation must stop.

The procedure also states that, if the aeroplane cannot accept the wide nozzle, a nozzle with a smaller diameter, available in the vehicle, will be fitted for refuelling and removed once the refuelling is finished. The operator must then fill out a grade order confirmation form, which he will get signed by the pilot.

Ce formulaire doit être	e utilisé si : (coche	(r les cases)	
<ol> <li>aucun autocollant d'</li> </ol>	identification du type	e de carburant n'est visible ;	ou
2. l'embout sélectif n'e	st pas adapté à l'orifi	ice du réservoir de l'avion ; o	011
3. Tavion est equipe d remulissance des un	un moteur dieset et p itocollants, indicuter	t à la fois un avitaillemer	ars o at e
carburéacteur (Jet Fi	sel) et en carburant d	iesel 1 ou	
🗌 4. de site d'Air BP, à l'a	éroport de	bén	éfic
d'une autorisation es	ceptionnelle du fait d	le la nécessité d'utiliser un en	nbo
non selectif pour avi	tailler la majorité des	s avacins.	
Renseignements sur P Le nilote ou l'ordrateur de	avion et confirm	ation des exigences :	
Registration / Immorrie	ulation	Type d'avion	_
		522	
Exigences on early and	at		_
Exigences en caroura	TYPE DE CARBUS	ANT (1) OUANTITÉ	-
			-
JEI FUEL	100		
(Aviation Turbine Kerosin	(Q)		_
AVGAS			
(Essence aviation)			_
(*) Inserire le type approprié de	ans la case, c'est-à-dire Tracker	Jet A-1, Jet A, Augus 10042, etc	1
le confirme qu'il est correct	d'utiliser le type de c	arburant sasmentionné pour l'	'avi
en référence ci-dessus. I co	afirm it is correct to	use the type of fuel for the ai	heri
mentioned above references	<i>d.</i>		
Nom / Name t	Dign	onare :	
Date :			
Heure / hour :			_
	placement de l'er	nbout sélectif :	
Confirmation du rem	maccinent ac a ci		
Confirmation du rem Section à remplir par l'opé Si on formulaire est utilité en	nateur Air BP	eorrespondant au point 2 ci-d	less
Confirmation du remp Section à remplir par l'opé Si ce formulaire est utilisé or	rateur Air BP raison d'une situation	n correspondant au point 2 ci-d	lessi
Confirmation du rem Section à remplir par l'opé Si ce formulaire est utilisé or CONFIRMEZ QUE	rateur Air BP raison d'une situation VOUS AVEZ Sig	i correspondant au point 2 ci-c nature	less

Figure 3: grade order confirmation form

# 2.4 Information on the refuelling tanker

On the refuelling tanker, there is a black placard indicating « JET A1 ».



Figure 4: refuelling tanker

The hose is equipped with a wide nozzle. A safety system prevents the vehicle from starting if the hose is not equipped with the wide nozzle. A nozzle with a smaller diameter tip is also available on the tanker to replace the wide nozzle on the hose, in the context of the exceptional procedure mentioned above.

<sup>(6)</sup>Including tax.

# 2.5 Information on the operator in charge of refuelling

The operator in charge of refuelling had been trained on the risks associated with a refuelling error and on the ways of avoiding it. He knew that this type of aeroplane could have various engines and required increased vigilance.

He stated that he received a request from the stopover management office. He noted the type of fuel, the registration of the aeroplane and the position on the stand. He filled out the order form and performed the tanker test before leaving.

He did not remember if he had asked the pilot for confirmation of the type of fuel on arrival at the aeroplane. The latter asked him the price of fuel and he showed him the price list, indicating verbally the price of Jet A1 «  $1.28 \in toutes taxes$  »<sup>(6)</sup>. As the pilot repeated this price, it reinforced his belief that the latter was asking for this type of fuel.



Tarifs carburant applicables au : 1ER Août 2015

# JET A1

Prix Hors Toutes Taxes : Valeur TIC : Prix HT (TIC incluse) : Prix TTC (TVA 20%) : 0,7500 € / Litre 0,3211 € / Litre 1.0711 € / Litre (valeur indicative) 1,2853 € / Litre (valeur indicative)

Rappel 1 : La délivrance de carburant JET Al en exonération de TIC et ou de la TVA est soumise à la présentation des documents justificatifs d'exonération en cours de validité. En l'absence de justificatifs le carburant sera facturé TTC.

Rappel 2 : Les paiements comptants <u>se font à la livraison</u>. Aucune facture ne sera envoyée avec paiement différé.

Rappel 3 : Les certificats « commercial of use » émis par les autorités de l'ile de man, ne permettent pas l'exonération de taxes (TIC et TVA).

### AVGAS 100 LL

Prix Hors Toutes Taxes : Valeur TIC : Prix HT (TIC incluse) : Prix TTC (TVA 20%) : 1,2886 € / Litre (valeur indicative) 0,3781 € / Litre 1,6666 € / Litre (valeur indicative) 2.000 € / Litre

Figure 5 : fuel rates

He did not check if there were placards on the wings before starting refuelling. He didn't remember having removed the wide nozzle but did not fill out a grade order confirmation form, mandatory with a change of nozzle. He filled out the delivery note that indicated refuelling with Jet A1, then had the form signed by the pilot.

He stated that he started working at 14 h 00 and had had a busy day<sup>(7)</sup>. It was the fourth day in a series of six working days. He felt tired and may have been less vigilant than usual.

<sup>(7)</sup>He had previously undertaken ten refuellings and one tanker refill.

6/10

He added that a change of nozzle was common at this aerodrome because of the large number of helicopters. In fact, the use of the wide nozzle for refuelling helicopters with Jet A1 presents a risk of damage to the tank filler ports, due to their design. The nozzle with a smaller diameter was thus often used after obtaining the pilot's agreement, filling out the grade order confirmation forms not being systematic for clients that regularly refuelled at Cannes. He added that he did not speak English very well and mainly communicated in French with pilots. He stated that he had spoken in French with the pilot of D-ESPE. 2.6 Pilot information <sup>(8)</sup>Swiss nationality, The pilot<sup>(8)</sup> had a total of 18,213 flying hours, of which 900 on type and 12 in the German-speaking. previous three months. He spoke German and English fluently but did not speak French well. He said that he had originally planned to fill up on the Monday morning before the departure. When the ramp agent asked him if he wanted to refuel he refused, indicating that he would do it on Monday. The ramp agent insisted, explaining to him that refuelling would be fast and that Monday morning was generally very busy. The pilot then accepted. When the passengers were leaving the stand, he saw the refuelling tanker approaching. According to him, the tanker was small and so he didn't think that it could contain Jet A1. He stated that he had asked the operator in charge of refuelling the price of the fuel and that the price indicated by the latter <sup>(9)</sup>Before tax. « 1.28 hors toutes taxes »<sup>(9)</sup> was that of AVGAS. He didn't notice that the type of fuel was mentioned on the delivery note, he only checked the quantity and the total price before signature. During the pre-flight check, he checked the colour of the fuel by looking into the (10) AVGAS 100 LL tank ports located above the wing. He was sure that the fuel was blue in colour<sup>(10)</sup>. petro is blue, Jet He stated that he had been very careful with this check because he knew of a case A1 is transparent. of a refuelling error at this aerodrome. He did the drain to check for the absence of water. He did not pay attention to the colour, the small quantity of fuel sampled making that impossible. He added that the engine started up correctly and that all of the parameters were normal during the tests made on the engine. He was wearing a noise-reduction headset, which may have altered his perception of the engine noise during taxiing. 2.7 Testimony One of the passengers heard the pilot order AVGAS from the ramp agent. The person present in the stopover management office stated that he/she received a call from the ramp agent for a refuelling operation with Jet A1 for this aeroplane. He/she noted this in the order book and sent the request to the operator in charge of refuelling. According to a ramp agent, it is usual to offer additional fuel to all pilots.

# 2.8 Delivery note

An example of a delivery note is illustrated below. The operator ticks the box corresponding to the fuel delivered.

NC						
NZ		Airoparts de la C	ate cf'Amar		RI Nº	7722
	5	A à Directois et Conseil de S	urveillance		DLIN	
	an cabip	al de 145 000 € - RCS Nice 4	93 479 409			
Y		Airoport Cannes	Mandelleu Eleite Mitt		PON DE	LIVDAISO
~		DE 10 Coones la Boo	a France		BON DE	LIVRAISU
	Tel: +33 (0)8	20 426 666- Fax : +33 (0)4 1	83 90 40 15		Deli	very Note
AEROPORT:	5 Siège	social : rueCostos et Bellon	to BIP 3331		Don	very note
DE LA COTE D'AZU	R	06206 Nice CEDEX	3 - France			
	Tél : +33 (0)8	20 423 333- Fax 1+33 (0)4 (	3 21 30 29		AE	ROPORT
					CANINES	MANDELIEI
ION FILL RAPAINON		BON DE REPRISE			CANNES	SMANDELIEU
Delivery monint		Defuellingreceipt	1 1		LFI	MD / CEQ
Obligatoire : coch	er une case / Man	idatory : box one box			DATE:	/20
SANS TIC		AVEC TK				MODE DE PAIEMENT
Without Excise Duty		With Excise Duty				Method of payment
Obligatoire : cost	and upon proper ( Marrie	dalars : list own how			FACTURE	ESPECES
Congesore . cou	ser une cape / wan	callery . etc. one out			Invoice	Cash
SANS TVA		AVEC TVA				CHEQUE
Without VAT		With VAT				Choque
Obligatoire : cod	her une case / Man	datory : tict one box				CARTE BANCAIRE
	and an and a second					Gredit card
APPEL / Call : H	ARRIVEE AV	NON / Antral : H	DEBUT P	LEN / Start :	H FIN	DE PLEIN / Finish :
			-			1
	CLIENT / Custom	NOT .	100000000000000000000000000000000000000	VOL / Flig	nt	APPAREIL / Airc
NOM / Name			PROVENAN	CIE / Fram		TYPE
			DESTRUCTOR OF	and the second		1000
ADRESSE / Address			DESTINATIO	PR4 / 10/		
			ESCALE/N	and Rings		MMATRICULATION )
						Augustation
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1	MMANDE : A rense i : To systematicali	igner systematiquement p y fill prior b each overwir AVGAS 100LL	N*DE VOL / ar to pilote ou t ig fuelling open	Flight number Tassistant event atlen QUANTI Quantity	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In liters	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1	MMANDE : A rense i : To systematicali	rigner systematiquement p y fill prior b each overwir AVGAS 100LL NOM / Name	N°DE VOL / ar le pilote ou l ag fuelling oper	Flight number fadsistant avant stier QUANT/ Quantity 51Gt	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Ibers NATURE	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1	MMANDE : A rense : To systematical APRES PLEIN	igner systematiquement p y till prior b sach overwis AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nime	N°DE VOL / ar le pilote ou l ng fueling oper	Flight number Tassistant avant atlen QUANTI Quantity SIG	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Ilters NATURE	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1	MMANDE : A rense i : To systematical APRES PLEIN After refuelling	igner systematiquement p yfill prior b each overwie AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nime	N°DE VOL /	Flight number Tassistant avant atlen QUANTT Quantity SIGP	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Ibers NATURE	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1	APRES PLEIN After refueling Avant PLEIN	igner systematiquement ( y till prior b each overvie AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nime	N°DE VOL / er le pilote ou l g fueling open	Flight number Passistant event atier QUANTI QUANTI QUANTI SIGN	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In liters NATURE	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1	APRES PLEIN APRES PLEIN After refuelling AVANT PLEIN Before	igner systematiquement p yfill prior 5 each overvela AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nime	NTDE VOL /	Flight humber Frasilitant avant atlee QUANTI Quantity SIG	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Illers NATURE	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1	APRES PLEIN APRES PLEIN Attar refuelling AVANT PLEIN Before refuelling	Algner systematiquement ( y fill prior b each overwise AVGAS 100LLL NOM / Name	NYDE VOL /	Pipt number Passistant avant atler QUANTI Quantity SIG	chaque piein au TE EN LITRE / In liters NATURE	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE	APRES PLEIN After refueling AVANT PLEIN Before refueling	Igner systematiquement p yr III prior 5 isach overwin AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nme 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LVRE (Litres)	NTDE VOL /	Piph number Tassistant avant utier QUANTT Quantity SIGP	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Bers NATURE	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE	APRES PLEN APRES PLEN Attraction Avant plant	tigner systematiquement ( y till prior b sach overwire AVGAS 100LL NOM / Name 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LVRE (Liters) Guandty is liters	NYDE VOL /	Pliph number Tassistant avant uter QUANTI Quantity SIGI	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Illers WATURE	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE	AMANDE : A rense i : To systematical APRES PLEIN After refueling RVANT PLEIN Before refueling	Igner systematiquement p yr fill prior 5 sach overwir AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nime	NTDE VOL /	Pliph number Tassistant avant atlen QUANTT Quantity SIG9	chaque piein au TE EN LITRE / In liters NATURE HTT	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE	MMANDE : A rense ( : To systematical) APRES PLEIN Attan refuelting AVANT PLEIN Before refuelting	igner systematiquement ( ) till prior b sach overvale AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nome   I I I I  TOTAL LURE (Lites) Guantify is liters	NTDE VOL /	Pliph humber Tradict avant atler QUANTT Quantity SIGN	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In liters NATURE HTT €	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO DEDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE	MMANDE : A rens i : To systematical APRES PLEIN After refueling AVANT PLEIN Before refueling	igner systematiquement ( y fill prior b each overview AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nome	NTDE VOL /	Pliph number Tassistant svant atler QUANTT Quantity SIGN 1 1 1 1 Prix 1 X TIC X	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In liters NATURE HTT E	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE	APRES PLEIN APRES PLEIN Attan refooting AVANT PLEIN Before refuelting	Av GAS 100LL NOM / Nome	NTDE VOL /	Piiph number Trassistant avant atie: QUANTT	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In liters NATURE HTT E	Pitolet
CONFIRMATION DE CON CRUER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE	MMANDE : A rense : To systematical APRES PLEIN Attar refuelting AVANT PLEIN Before refuelting	ligher systematigaenerd i vill prior b each overall AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nene 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	NTDE VOL. /	Plight number Passistant avant saler GUANTT Guantity SIG I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In liters WATURE HTT E 0%	Pitolet
CONFIRMATION DE CO ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE	MMANDE : A rense : To systematical APRES PLEIN Attar refailing AVANT PLEIN Before refuelling	ligher systematiguenner ( vill grind to each overwith AVCAS 100LL NOM / Norse 1 1 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LURE (Lenes) Quantity is liters	NTDE VOL. /	Fright number Frasilistant avant atien: QUANTT Quantity SIGE I I I Prix: X TIC X X TIC X X VAL	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In liters NATURE HTT E 0% EUR	
CONFIRMATION DE COU ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITAILLEUR Relating provider	MMANDE : A rense : To systematical APRES PLEIN Attar refuelting AVANT PLEIN Before refuelting	lighter systematigaeneerd y VII prior b each overvalue AVGAS 100LL NOM / Nerve 1 i i i 1 i i i 1 TOTAL LIVIE (schers) Guantity is liters	NPE VOL /	Fight number Pasistant avant atie QUANTT Quantity SiGI 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Bers NATURE HTT EUR EUR Soft	Pitolet
CONFIRMATION DE COL CRUEIR CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITAILLEUR Relating provider	MIMANDE : A rense : To systematical APRES PLEIN After refueling AVANT PLEIN Before refueling	lighter systematicpennent () fül prior b sach overanla AVGAS 1001LL NOM / Nerve 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LIVIE (Liberes) Quantity in Hers ME et rosces Rescuence (etc.)	NTDE VOL. / /	Fight number Transident avanter also OUANATT Ouantity SIGE 1 1 Prix: X TIC X TIC X TIC X Arrice Arrise	chaque périn au TE EX LITTE / In liters WATURE HTT E E UR E UR E UR E UR E UR E UR E UR	Pintolet
CONFIRMATION DE COU CREDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITALLEUX Relusing provider	MIMANDE : A remain i : To systematical APRES PLEIN Attar refuelling AVM/F PLEIN Before refuelling	lighter systematigaenner (r 11) gefort 5 each overwelk AVCAS 100LL NOM / Nime 1 i i 1 TOTAL LURE (; hers) Guardity is Illers	NPDE VOL. /	Fight number Transition avant ative CUUANTI	chaque plein su TE EN LITTE / I In Blass WATURE HTT € € 00% EUR Unit Surg Jun Rob, Insta	Piriolet
CONFIRMATION DE COU CREDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITALLEUR Relating provider	MUANDE : A renaria	lighter systematicparement of relit prior to each overanite AVCAS 1001LL NOM / Nerve I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I	NPDE VOL. / arr to plate ou to g fueling open	Fight number Transition avanter stere OLANATT	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Blass WATURE HTT E E DYS EUR Cost Cost Cost Cost Cost Cost Cost Cost	Patolet
CONFIRMATION DE COU CREDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITALLEUX Relusing provider Intension (organized data)	MUMADE: A resource systematical To systematical APPEIS PLEIN APPEIS PLEIN AVM/IT PLEIN AVM/IT PLEIN AVM/IT Statute Sector AVM/IT	lighter systematigaenner (synthesis systematigaenner) (synthesis synthesis synthesis synthesis synthesis synthesis synthesis systematical systematic	NPDE VOL. / arise plateling open grant by the ling open in the line open in the line open in the line is a line open in the l	Flipt number Tassistand avant assiste Quantity SIGD 1 1 1 1 1 1 Prixit X TIC X TIC X 2000 VALUANT Outhout SIGD 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	chaque plein au TE EN LITTE / In Illers WATURE HTT E E E BUR UNIT Ko at Jun Rep, Mann Mann, Mann Mann, Mann Mann, Mann Mann, Mann Mann, Mann Mann, Mann Mann, Mann Mann, Mann, Mann Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann Mann, Mannn, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mannn, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mannn, Mann, Mannn, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mannn, Mann, Mannn, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mann, Mannn, Mannn, Mann, Mannn, Mann, Mannn, Mannn, Mannn, Mannn, Mannn, Mann,	Priotect     Priotect     T
CONFIRMATION DE COU CREDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITALLEUR Relating provider VICTORIES Lamer terminal MICLE ANDRO THE INGENERATION	MUANDE : A rensult 1 To systematical APRES PLEN Abra refuelting AVM/T FEIN Bafore refuelting	lighter systematicparement of yr III prior to each overania AVCAS 1001LL NOM / Nerne IIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIIII	NPDE VOL. / arrise plate ou un g tuelling open un un un un un un un un un un un un un	Fight number Translation (available) GULANT GULANT GULANT GULANT GULANT ACCOUNT SIGN SIGN SIGN SIGN SIGN SIGN SIGN SIGN	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Blass WATURE HITT E E UN E UR E UR E UR E UR E UR E UR E	Pistolet
CONFIRMATION DE COU CROCER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE ADENT AVITALLEUR Relating provider Internet, categorie Marco Unitation, andre provider	MIANDE : A resource of the systematical To systematical APPRES PLEIN APPRES PLEIN Arking traditional Arking traditional arking and a systematical arking a syste	Apper systematiquement ( I'll prior to each overwith AVCAS 100LL NOM / Nerro 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LURE (, heres) Guardity is iters and it species interactions (in the second priority is iters	NPDE VOL. / arrise plateless open guesting open arrise plateling open arrise arrive ar	Fight number Translatert avent attaine QUANT Quantity 5/60 1 1 1 1 Prix: X TIC X TIC X TIC X TIC X TIC X X TIC X X TIC X X TIC X X X X X X X X X X X X X	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Blars WATURE HTT E E E Blar Math. Real Jun. Real, Math. Real Math. Real Jun. Real, Math.	2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2
CONFIRMATION DE COU ORDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITALLEUR Robusting provider Variations - Company and a confirmation memory and the second and a confirmation and the second and the second and a confirmation and the second and the seco	MUMADE: A resource of the systematical in the systematical interview of the systematical intervi	lighter systematicpanser ( VIII prior 1) each overvelue AVGAS 100LL NOM / None 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LUNE (Lanes) Claunity is illers District spaces Regulaters (n) prior (n) District	PADE VOL. / arries plate ou tag g fuelling open arries plateling open arries are an arried and arries arries arried arries arries arries arries arries arries arried arries arries arries arries arries arries arries arried arries arries arries arries arries arries arries arried arries arries arries arries arries arries arries arries arries arried arries arries arried arries ar	Flight number Translation (avant Translation (avant Guantity) SiGR 1 1 1 1 Prixi TriC X Z TriC X TriC X Z TriC X Z X TriC X Z Z X Z TriC X Z Z X Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z Z	chaque plein au TE EN LITRE / In Itera NATURE HTT E E E UR SUR SUR SUR SUR SUR SUR SUR SUR SUR	Pintolet
CONFIRMATION DE COU CREDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITAILLEUR Relueiling provider ANDRITES Lighters managed ANDRITES Lighters managed ANDRITES Lighters managed ANDRITES Lighters managed ANDRITES ANDRITES AND AND AND ANDRITES AND AND AND AND ANDRITES AND AND AND AND AND AND ANDRITES AND AND AND AND AND AND ANDRITES AND AND AND AND AND AND AND ANDRITES AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND ANDRITES AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND ANDRITES AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND	MUANDE : A renaria	Igner systemiliperner ( Iff grind banh overvier) AVCAS 100LL NDM / Nmm 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LVRE (Lees) Quartity in Hers NDM et usuals inscatterer ( planted by in Hers NDM et usuals inscatterer ( REPREJENTANT LA C	APOE VOL. / arrise plate ou lug generation of the second	Fliph number Translation (avant ansister Quantity SIGD 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	chaque plein au TE EN LITTE / In Blass WATURE HTT E E DY5 EUR Cost Cost Cost Cost Cost Cost Cost Cost	2 2 2 3 3 4 3 4 3 4 3 4 3 4 3 4 3 4 3 4
CONFIRMATION DE COU CRECER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITALLEUR Relating provider ANTENTON: CONSUMERT AVITAL Intention Constant Anti- anticitation (Constant) Anticitation (Constant) Adeate gue ce BL	MUMADE: A resource of the systematical To systematical APPELS PLEIN APPELS PLEIN AVM/T PLEIN Solution: Internet adult or Internet adult of the Internet adult	Apper systematiquement ( VIII prior b each overwhe AVCAS 100LL NOM / Nome 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LURE (, mens) Guardity & Hers More et vocale rescuences et al. ( definition of the second state of the prior of the second state of the REPRESENTANT LA C REPRESENTANT LA C	PADE VOL. / arr la plate ou la glateling opera- la i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i	Fliph number Tassistant avant tel: QUANTT Quantity Biology Comment C	chaque piein au TE EN LITRE / In Ibera NATURE HTT E EUR LUR LUR LUR LUR LUR LUR LUR LUR LUR L	Partolet Partolet
CONFIRMATION DE COO CREDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITAILLEUR Reluting provider ADENT AVITAILLEUR Reluting provider ADENT AVITAILLEUR Reluting provider ADENT AVITAILLEUR Reluting provider ADENT AVITAILLEUR Reluting provider ADENT AVITAILLEUR Reluting provider ADENT AVITAILLEUR Reluting Drovider ADENT AVITAILLEUR RELATION TO ADENT AVITAILLEUR RELATION TO ADENT AVITAILLEUR RELATION TO ADENT AVITAILLEUR RELATION TO ADENT AVITAILLEUR ADENT AVITAILLEUR RELATION TO ADENT AVITAILLEUR RELATION TO ADENT AVITAILLEUR RELATION TO ADENT AVITAILLEUR ADENT AVITAILLEUR RELATION TO ADENT AVITAILLEUR RELATION TO ADENT AVITAILLEUR	MIANDE : A renational 1 To hydromatical APRES PLEN Abar influeting AVM/T PLEN Bafore refuelting I an encourse prepare intermental andre in the moment and the in- stances.	Apper systematiquement / Iff grind to each overvelvely AVCAS 100LL NDM / Nmme TOTAL LVRE (Lemes) Quantity in Hers Mer et suscess mercaneter te (n photo te sus net minus 4 beca mer et suscess mercaneter te (n mercaneter te suscesses) REPRESENTANT LA C ext que e proceita mail haven	APOE VOL / / arrispitate ou la gituelling open	Fliph number Translation (available) QUANTT Quantity SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD	chaque périn au TE EN LITRE / In Ibles WATURE HTT E E UN E UR E UR E UR E UR E UR E UR E	Pietolet Pietolet
CONFIRMATION DE COU CRECER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITALLEUR Reduiling provider ARTISTICS: CARGENET AVITAL Reduiling provider ARTISTICS: CARGENET AVITAL RECOMPANY AND AND AND AND AND ARTISTICS: CARGENET AVITAL RECOMPANY AND AND AND AND AND AND ARTISTICS: CARGENET AVITAL RECOMPANY AND AND AND AND AND AND ARTISTICS: CARGENET AVITAL ARTISTICS: CARGENET AVIT	MUMADE: A resolution I To systematical APPELS PLEIN APPELS PLEIN AVM/IT PLEIN Solicity Information Inf	Apper systematiguement ( VIII prior b each overwise AVCAS 100LL NOM / Neme 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LURE (, mens) Ocumity is items More en restauration in the second prior of the second second second second REPRESENTANT LA C excited que e produit ainsi	SPDE VOL. / arr le pitote ou le glading operation i	Flight number Tassistant (avant Tassistant (avant	chaque piein au TE EN LITRE / In Ibers WATURE HTT E EUR UN EUR MATURE EUR EUR MATURE EUR EUR EUR EU	Pitolet Pitolet
CONFIRMATION DE COU CREDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1	MUMADE: A research of the systematical To systematical APPEIS PLEIN APPEIS PLEIN ANANY PLEIN Before subuling ANANY PLEIN Before subuling ANANY PLEIN Before subuling and a	Apper systematiquement ( If professional and approximately a series of a series overwrite AVCAS 100LL NDM / Nerros I I I I I I TOTAL LIVIE (Livers) Quantity is liters NDM of transmission and the series of a series o	APOE VOL / / arrispitate ou la gituelling oper-	Fliph number Translation (avent ansister Quantity) SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD SIGD	chaque périn au TE EN LITTE / In Ibles WATURE HTT E E DY5 EUR Curt cart Jun 2005, erem en tar Jun 2005, erem e	Platet
CONFIRMATION DE COU CRECER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITALLEUR Relating provider ARTISTICS: CONSIST A LANSE Relating provider ARTISTICS: CONSIST A LANSE Relating provider ARTISTICS: CONSIST A LANSE Relating of the second and the second article and the second article a	MUMADE: A resource in the systematical interview of the systematic	Apper systematiguement ( VIII prior b each overwhy AVCAS 100LL NOM / Nmme 1 1 1 1 TOTAL LURE (, mens) Country is liters Double is an antibula the statement resources and the system REPRESENTANT LAC excited que e produit almail d control at that I have ver sediment in the system and the system and the system and the system and the system I have a system and the system and the system REPRESENTANT LAC	VICE VOL. / arr le plate ou le g fuelles goard i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i	Flight number Translation (avant Translation (avant Guantity) Biology 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	chaque pien au TE EN LITRE / In Itera NATURE HTT EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR UNS EUR EUR EUR EUR EUR EUR EUR EUR EUR EUR	Patolet Patolet
CONFIRMATION DE COU CREDER CONFIRMATION JET A-1 N° VEHICULE AGENT AVITALLEUR Relating provider ACTENTOR: CARENARY ANAL NUMBER AND AND AND AND AND AND ACTENTOR: CARENARY ANAL AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND AND	MUMADE: A research of the systematical interview of the systematic	Apper systematiquement ( If grind back beach overwin AVCAS 100LL NDM / Nerse TOTAL LVRE (Lenes) Quarty is liters and of photo is an entitle to the photo is an entitle to the entitle to the photo is an is the photo is an entitle to the entitle to the photo is an is the entitle to the photo is entitle to the photo is an is REPRESENTANT LA C ext of upon to addinant is not approximate to the entitle to the photo is an is entitle to the photo is entitle t	APOE VOL. / arrise plate ou in gituelling oper in a second second second in a second second second second second second second in a second second second second second second second second is second second second second second second second second is second second second second second second second second is second second second second second second second second second is second	Pipit number Tassistant avant due QUANT Guantity SiG0 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1	chaque plein au TE EN LITTE / In Blass WATURE HTT E E DY5 EUR Cost and Jub.RED, erem So So So So So So So So So So So So So	Pintolet           2           37           37           38           4           4           4           4           4           5           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           6           7           7           7           7           7           7           7           7           7           8           8           8           8           8           8           8           8           8           8           8           8           8           8           8           8 <td< td=""></td<>

Figure 6 : delivery note

### 2.9 Specific features in refuelling helicopters

The filler ports of some helicopters that run on JET A1 have smaller dimensions than those for wide nozzles.

### **3 - LESSONS LEARNED AND CONCLUSION**

### 3.1 Fuel order

The pilot accepted the ramp agent's offer to perform the refuelling on Friday evening while his attention was focused on other tasks.

The refuelling procedures in force at Cannes Mandelieu aerodrome do not anticipate that taking an order could be done by a ramp agent. The latter is thus not trained to take an order and does not know the associated procedure. It is however usual for him to ask the pilot the type of fuel required so that the operator in charge of refuelling comes to the stand with the tanker delivering the type of fuel required. The investigation was not able to determine precisely the exact terms used at the time of the order. An erroneous order for Jet A1 was relayed to the operator in charge of refuelling through the stopover management office.

# 3.2 Confirmation of type of fuel

The pilot asked the operator in charge of refuelling for the price of fuel before the latter asked him for confirmation of the type of fuel. The operator showed him the price list, indicating verbally «  $1.28 \in toutes taxes$  » (including tax). The pilot understood « 1.28 hors toutes taxes » (before tax) and asked to fill up. This misunderstanding was likely due to the fact that the pilot did not speak French well. The price of Jet A1 including tax was identical to the price of AVGAS before tax. The pilot having repeated the stated price, the operator understood that the latter was asking to fill up with Jet A1. He thus did not formally ask for confirmation of the grade of fuel, as specified in the procedure for taking an order.

The pilot did not in fact make an explicit order, possibly because of a lack of attention at the end of a flight. He did not notice the indication of the type of fuel on the tanker and thought that it contained AVGAS because of its size.

Before starting refuelling, the operator did not check the placards on the aircraft, as specified in the procedure. These were marked « *AVGAS ONLY* ». The tank filler ports did not allow nozzles with foolproof devices to be used; the operator changed the nozzle, probably from habit, before going to the aeroplane. He did not fill out the grade order confirmation form, which should have been signed by the pilot, possibly also from habit. This would likely have allowed the pilot to notice the error.

Following the refuelling, the operator in charge of refuelling filled in the delivery note indicating the type of fuel delivered and got the pilot to sign the form. The latter signed the form without checking the type of fuel mentioned.

### 3.3 Pre-flight procedures

The pilot stated that he knew of a previous event with a refuelling error at this aerodrome. He was thus very careful to check the type of fuel at the level of the tank cap. However, this check was ineffective because the density of AVGAS 100LL meant that it settled on the surface of the fuel in the tank.

He did not check the type of fuel during the drain, as specified in the procedure. He said that the quantity of fuel sampled did not make this possible.

Further, the design of the fuel system did not guarantee the presence of JET A1 in the collector tanks. The check on the type of fuel during the drain was thus ineffective.

### 3.4 Conclusion

The engine shutdown resulted from refuelling with the wrong fuel, due to an initial error in taking the order, incomplete application of the procedures by the operator in charge of refuelling and the pilot's lack of attention, which did not make it possible to recover from the error.

The quantity of 100LL present in the collector tanks and ports made it possible to taxi and perform the takeoff run without the pilot noticing any anomalies. Once this quantity of 100LL was consumed, the JET A1 present in the lower parts of the tanks supplied the engine and led to the power drop.

The following factors contributed to the accident:

- the coordination between the aerodrome operator and its sub-contractors when the ramp agent takes the fuel order, which do not encourage the operator in charge of refuelling to confirm the type of fuel in a service that is provided under strong time pressure;
- the usual practice for refuelling certain types of helicopters, whose tank filler ports are not compatible with the dimensions of the standard refuelling nozzles, makes habitual the changing of the nozzle for refuelling with JET A1, which occasionally leads to filling out a grade order confirmation form. This thus reduces the effectiveness of the obvious safety barrier for the operator represented by the presence of foolproof devices specific to each grade of fuel;
- □ the ineffectiveness of the check item for the type of fuel in the preflight procedure, under the conditions in which the event occurred.

Following the accident, the sub-contractor in charge of fuel supply decided to use specific delivery notes for each type of fuel.